

## Clarification to “Zero Temperature Limits of Gibbs States”

In Theorem 1.2, the term “sequence” is poorly chosen. It should be understood as continuous parameter family, as indicated by the notation  $(\mu_{\beta\varphi})_{\beta>0}$ . The content of this theorem is that if one chooses for *each*  $\beta$  an equilibrium state  $\mu_{\beta\varphi}$ , then necessarily  $\lim_{\beta\rightarrow\infty} \mu_{\beta\varphi}$  will not exist.

Since there has been some confusion about this result, we would like to make some additional remarks.

- If there were a unique Gibbs measure for each  $\beta$  then there would be a unique choice  $\mu_{\beta\varphi}$ , and the result could be formulated more cleanly as simply  $\lim_{\beta\rightarrow\infty} \mu_{\beta\varphi}$  does not exist; but in our example we believe that uniqueness does not hold at low temperatures.
- By compactness of the space of probability measures, for any such choice there will always exist subsequences  $(\beta_i)_{i\in\mathbb{N}}$  such that the limit  $\lim_{i\rightarrow\infty} \mu_{\beta_i\varphi}$  exists. The result is about continuous parameter families. Note that continuous families are more natural physically, since the process of cooling a system is a continuous one.
- There is nothing new in the fact that one can choose *some* divergent family  $\beta \mapsto \mu_{\beta\varphi}$  of equilibrium states. For example in the Ising model one can choose a family which alternates, when  $\beta$  is large, between the ergodic + and - phases. However, it is also possible to choose families which converge to one of the ground states, and these are the families one expects to observe “experimentally” if one cools such a system slowly: it will converge to a ground state. On the other hand, in our example it is *not possible* to choose *any* family which converges to a ground state: if you cool this system sufficiently slowly, there will be some observable which fluctuates significantly and continues to do so at arbitrarily low temperatures.